



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

him. The passage of the Laws cited in support of the statement is completely misunderstood. I open Professor Mackail's¹ delightful lectures on Greek poetry and find an eloquent page about an awesome lightning flash which illuminates an awful pause before the retreat of the Trojans. Nothing could be more impressive—if true. But there is no lightning flash, and the simile does not illuminate the terror-stricken pause of the Trojans, but the breathing space won by the Greeks seventeen lines after the pause. If we must choose, I prefer American thinness and dryness to this. We may pay too high a price not only for a German *geistreiche Combination*, but for French neatness of antithesis and English romantic sentiment. To adapt the phrases of Emerson, let us sit at home with might and make the best of ourselves.

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO.

PAUL SHOREY.

REVIEW

The Lay Of Dolon. The Tenth Book of Homer's Iliad. Some notes on its language, verse, and contents. With Remarks by the way on the Canons and Methods of Homeric Criticism. By Alexander Shewan. London: Macmillan and Co. (1911). Pp. xl + 290. \$3.25.

After an Introduction of 27 pages, in which the author expresses his satisfaction that the battle is turning against the Dissectors of Homer, a "Provisional" Bibliography is given. This contains the names of about 140 writers and over 200 titles. One is skeptical of such lists, since often there is nothing in the book to show the author has read much there mentioned. In this Bibliography three works written by three Americans are named, while in the book itself fifteen works by eleven Americans are quoted, and so quoted as to show complete mastery of each of these fifteen works. This ratio of five works quoted to each one named in the Bibliography is, I judge, about the average ratio, so that hardly less than 1000 separate books or documents are used, in addition to lexica, indices, and grammars.

Not only does Mr. Shewan give the drift of a book in a few apt sentences, but he has at his command the various reviews thereof. Thus, e. g., he gives the argument advanced by Geddes with his own judgment of its value, also the opinion of Father Browne, and on p. 131 a summary and appreciation of the brilliant review by Professor Packard which was published in the first number of the American Journal of Philology. This thoroughness is not exceptional but the rule. The mastery shown of Homeric literature, even the most remote and inaccessible, is astounding and, to me, most discouraging.

¹ See THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 4:93-95.

The language, verse, vocabulary, use of digamma, and repeated verses are all put to the severest test and they agree in placing the Doloneia with the other books of the Iliad. Linguistic tests as well as absence of interpolation show that it is one of the books most free from contamination; cf. p. 59: "It may almost be said that not one exceptional construction has been established, and the few forms that are special to the Book can be explained without difficulty".

How weak some standard arguments are is shown by this striking example. It is well known that *σεδοστοῖσιν* is found only in K 462 and in the Odyssey, apparently a strong argument for Odyssean affinity, but, as Mr. Shewan remarks, "In the Iliad there is no occurrence outside of K of the dative plural of this word in any gender; so no inference can be drawn".

The theories based on the use of the article are now exploded, as the assumed difference between the Iliad and Odyssey in this regard has been shown to be a delusion, but Mr. Shewan adds a most effective argument by showing that certain large sections of Paradise Lost differ widely from each other in the use of the article; hence no conclusions could be fairly drawn, even if the supposed divergence in Homer were a fact.

Every difference between the Iliad and the Odyssey recedes as one draws near. Take an example. Monroe, Odyssey 333, wrote: "Neglect of position is perceptibly commoner in the Iliad than in the Odyssey". Mr. Shewan has investigated this with great care and finds that there are 29 cases of inexcusable neglect of position in the Iliad, and but 20 in the Odyssey, the reverse of Monro's assumption.

Gemoll in his treatise on Repetitions argued that Kappa was later than the Odyssey "since the poet of this book imitated the great scenes of the Odyssey, and of the Odyssey only". Mr. Shewan asks, "Why did he not imitate the Iliad? Were Kappa and the Odyssey written before the Iliad?" He then shows hidden resemblances binding Kappa with the Iliad, not those of imitation, but of a common original author.

A frequent criticism on verse 157, where Nestor wakens Diomedes "by shoving him with the foot", is that it is an unheroic method; Gemoll asks "Why could Nestor not waken Diomedes with the spear?" Mr. Shewan replies "The spear was sharp at both ends and not suitable for so delicate an operation". So simple, and so sensible.

The sum of the author's arguments is this: K agrees in every essential detail with the rest of the Iliad, yet differs enough in setting, action, description, and language to show that it is no mere imitation, but a creation of the same genius who composed the other books.

In the Introduction he modestly says: "The contents of the book are mostly spade-work of a humble description". Yet, good as every part of the book is, by all odds the best things in it are the author's own. It is hard to single out any one portion for especial praise, but the arguments adduced to show that *K* is an integral part of the *Iliad* and that it is referred to in later books seem to me superb (see pp. 144 ff.). These arguments are not of the sort one gets by studying lexica and indices, but come only from an intimate knowledge and appreciation of the poems. The modesty and reserve with which all opinions are expressed win the confidence of the reader.

The *Doloneia* has long been an outcast. But Muelder, Rothe, and Lang have recently defended its rights to membership in the family of the *Iliad*, and the case has been immeasurably strengthened by Mr. Shewan, whose facts, logic, and conclusions seem to me final and unanswerable. Homeric critics will not answer them, few will try; they will simply "go round" and ignore them.

This book places its author in the very front rank of Homeric scholars.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY.

JOHN A. SCOTT.

THE CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION OF PITTSBURGH AND VICINITY

The sixth and final meeting of the fourth year of The Classical Association of Pittsburgh and Vicinity was held conjointly with a meeting of the local Archaeological society at Washington and Jefferson College, Saturday, April 29.

The guest of honor was Professor Charles E. Bennett, of Cornell University. Following the address of welcome by President James D. Moffat, Professor Bennett delivered an address on Perspective in Classical Study and Teaching. This was one of the strongest and clearest papers ever read before the association. His timely criticism of the dangerous and mischief working views of Edmiston, Showerman, and Babbitt was received enthusiastically by a large and appreciative audience. The noble work and the valiant enterprise of the graduate schools of this country and of other countries was clearly demonstrated. The carping criticism of those who see in a doctor's thesis only a weary wandering in meandering mazes through the realms of intellectual uncertainty was shown to be entirely out of perspective.

At two thirty Professor H. E. Wells, of Washington and Jefferson College, accompanied by Mrs. Wells, rendered several selections of ancient Greek music, which were heard with much interest and were received with great enthusiasm. Following this, Professor H. F. Allen, also of Washington

and Jefferson, gave in his usual clear and forceful style an illustrated paper on the Olympic games.

The following officers for next year were elected: President, Professor B. L. Ullman, University of Pittsburgh; Vice President, Miss Wilma Schmitz, Pittsburgh High School; Secretary-Treasurer, Professor William Douglas, Shadyside Academy.

ROBERT B. ENGLISH, President.

WASHINGTON AND JEFFERSON COLLEGE.

AD FERIATURUM¹

I, puer, abiciens libros paulisper inanes,
neu pede praecipiti cymbala terna mane.
Iam resonis volves mellitum gummi labellis,
castaneasque nuces dente crepante teres.
Undique fatalem menthae spirabis odorem,
et iacies uda chartea tela manu.
Nec capies caeca versutos arte magistros,
nec repetes tristis, sole cadente, lares.
I, puer, invigilans aurigae dona ferenti,
ne tibi promerito sarcina flagra gerat.
Pollicibus retegant instructis pruna placenta,
dum glomerata domus teque scholamque probet.
Necte choros: rapias, visco pendente, puellas:
oscula si fugient, at cito plura dabunt.
Mox equa suscipiet timidos nocturna labores.
Cras removebit onus, vae! medicina tuum.
Tunc ego mulcebo caput, et bene nota monebo:
pectore sollicito tu nova sponsa gemes.
I, puer, atque redi: "Iucundus, acerbus es idem:
nec tecum possum vivere, nec sine te".

EPIGRAMMATA

AD CLARISSIMAN MAGISTRAM, L. MINOR

Quamquam nomine tu MINOR vocaris,
geometra tamen gigas habetis!

AD CLARISSIMAN MAGISTRAM, F. COLTER

CULTER nomine tu quidem vocaris,
trux heu! materies, acuta, dira,
stillans sanguine, matribus feroxque,
at non indole tu tua nec usu
sed sane placidissima et benigna!

JOHN E. KENNY.

CENTRAL HIGH SCHOOL, St. Paul, Minnesota.

To subscribers who wish to make their files of Volume 4 complete we shall send copies of the various numbers, so long as our supply lasts, on receipt of a one cent stamp for each copy desired. Address Professor Knapp.

¹ These verses were written by Dr. Caskie Harrison, widely known for many years as a successful teacher of Latin and as principal of an important school in Brooklyn.